



COASTAL HAZARDS ADAPTATION RESILIENCY GROUP *for the San Francisco Bay Region*

STEERING COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Wednesday, October 19, 2016, 10:00 am - 1:00 pm

Location: Bay Area Metro Center, 375 Beale Street, San Francisco

Call in: (267) 930-4000 Code: 466055500 Host: 932111001

Participants

| Name | Organization | Name | Organization |
|-------------------|---------------------|------------------|---------------------|
| Craig Conner | USACE | Matt Gerhart | CSCC |
| Eric Simmons | FEMA | Michelle Iblings | ACFCWCD |
| Erika Powell | SMCFRM | Michelle Orr | ESA |
| Hank Ackerman | ACFCWCD | Ngoc Nguyen | SCVWD |
| Jason Sidley | DWR | Paul Detjens | CCCFCCD |
| Kathy Schaeffer | CRI | Roger Leventhal | Marin County |
| Len Materman | SFCJPA | Rohin Saleh | ACFCWCD |
| Lindy Lowe | BCDC | Sybil Hatch | Convey, Inc. |
| Maria Lorenzo-Lee | DWR | Warner Chabot | SFEI |

Action Items:

- Lindy Lowe will share PowerPoint slide depicting Bay Area entities that have sea level rise resiliency/adaptation programs and/or projects; Kathy Schaefer, Lindy Lowe, and Allison Brooks will work together to draft a diagram of agencies for the next steering committee meeting.
- Roger Leventhal or Paul Detjens will resubmit applications for the San Francisco Bay Restoration Authority advisory committee.
- Warner Chabot will work with Kathy Schaefer, Sybil Hatch, and Rohin Saleh on an email communication to update the stakeholder group on CHARG activities.
- Roger Leventhal will write up a summary of the creek dredging and sediment deposit project in Marin.
- Kathy Schaefer will send reference of Emery Rowe book about permitting process.
- All: Find someone to chair the sea level rise science and groundwater working groups; Roger Leventhal will talk with Len Materman about being co-chair of policy working group.

Add to next agenda:

- Bay Area entities working on sea level rise resiliency/adaptation projects—cooperation and overlap
- CHARG Coordination with IRWMP

Minutes:

- Overview of major sea level rise initiatives around San Francisco Bay – Kathy Schaefer
 - Many agencies are coordinating on sea level rise and have the same people involved in various working groups and activities. CHARG may bring value by providing long term solutions to government collaboration and funding efforts.
 - BCDC has started a diagram of how organizations are connected to each other; Lindy Lowe will share this PowerPoint slide with the group. Kathy Schaefer will work with Lindy Lowe and Allison Brooks to expand and/or refine this diagram for the for next CHARG steering committee meeting. The goal would be to develop a roadmap and a shared understanding of who's doing what and how to best coordinate. Need to identify who would be custodian of a list, ensuring information is kept up-to-date, where it will be housed and who will fund it.
 - State has a database that all state agencies are required to update yearly, which could be a moderately useful model.
 - There is currently a shortage of agreement about design specifications for shoreline adaptation measures.
- Status of CHARG Memorandum of Understanding
 - MOU will be updated in early-mid November to meet Alameda County's requirements to fund CHARG. Convey will circulate the updated MOU to steering committee members for signature. Hank Ackerman will circulate draft indemnification language.
- Status of CHARG facilitator procurement
 - Once MOU is approved by ACFC's Board of Supervisors the contract with ESA can be executed. Michelle Orr audited the meeting and was introduced.
- Welcome Jason Sidley/DWR. Jason has been following CHARG loosely through Terri Wegener over the years and will be working with Maria Lorenzo-Lee.
- Michelle Iblings is a member of the green infrastructure technical advisory committee (TAC) for California's Fourth Climate Change Assessment. The committee is focused on identifying natural infrastructure alternatives for adapting to sea level rise. Michelle attended a meeting On October 4, 2016, and reported on the following:
 - The effort is led by The Nature Conservancy (Sarah Newkirk), Point Blue (Maya Hayden), ESA (Bob Battalio), and NOAA (Jenna Judge).
 - The TAC will reconvene once more in April 2017. They will work over a twelve-month period to develop:
 - A definition of natural infrastructure for the California coastal context.
 - A typology of natural infrastructure approaches, with identified criteria, objectives, and/or outcomes.
 - Publish five to ten case studies of natural infrastructure projects in California
 - Develop a matrix and database of suitable geographic context, objective, cost, relative performance, and associated benefits by natural infrastructure project type.

- Bay Area Ecosystems Climate Change Consortium (BAECC) and the Climate Readiness Institute (CRI) recently held a “Responding to Sea Level Rise in the South Bay” workshop on natural infrastructure projects for multi-benefit ecosystem and ecosystem services. One outcome was an understanding of how projects are overlapping, and how nature intersects with natural flood protection. CRI has an NSF grant to model different bathometric changed and how work on the shoreline will affect shoreline water levels. CRI can use this in its modeling exercise. The workshop was also an opportunity to brainstorm priorities for action, fill data gaps, and determine where data is housed. Presentations are on BAECCC [website](#). Final product will be a report published sometime in the next few months.
- San Francisco Bay Restoration Authority advisory committee nominations
 - The Restoration Authority has two committees convening over the next year or two: the existing advisory committee, and a citizens' oversight committee. The advisory committee identifies priorities and what funding requests will be submitted. This committee is being reconstituted into 25 members; current members are being asked to reapply, and applications will be open to organizations through December. The reboot is in the interest of involving more community leaders and political leaders.
 - It would be of benefit to CHARG if there is overlap between CHARG members and members of the advisory committee. The application is available on the Authority’s [website](#).
 - Erika Powell is considering applying. The San Francisco Bay Restoration Authority Advisory Committee is in search of candidates that have a technical background, and Erika believes the County and cities on the Peninsula need representation in these discussions.
 - Roger Leventhal or Paul Detjens will resubmit as BAFPA representative.
 - Geographic location of committee members is considered, e.g. communities most impacted. There are also conflict of interest rules about membership. Because the Coastal Commission and the Association of Bay Area Governments (ABAG) members can staff, they are not allowed to sit on the committee. Federal agencies can participate.
- Interview with John King of the San Francisco Chronicle
 - John King is reporting on sea level rise. John interviewed Rohin Saleh about CHARG; Rohin showed him a visual model of regional impacts due to local sea level rise adaptation and described CHARG as being a group of implementers of shoreline projects. Convey will follow up with John and distribute the article to the steering committee members when it is published.
- Bay Conservation & Development Commission (BCDC) recommendations on rising sea levels
 - BCDC held a series of workshops beginning January 2016 on rising sea level, bay fill, tidal barriers, and rising bay projects. From the workshops, BCDC developed eight staff recommendations, which were adopted by the Commissioners on October 6, 2016.
 - Next step will be to develop implementation plans in coordination with other agencies, then schedule further workshops to determine how best to put the recommendations into practice.
 - BCDC should consider coordinating with the CHARG funding working group on the “Financing the Future” recommendation. Financing the Future group is focused on how to develop funding for the strategies. Agency has developed an approach and a narrative that has gone to governor's office and legislature, with the argument that we need to adapt to sea level rise.
 -

- BCDC should consider coordinating with the CHARG technical working group on the adaptation strategies recommendation. It will be important to identify information gaps and then perform the studies necessary to support the overall mitigation or adaptation strategies with defensible science.
- CHARG funding working group should coordinate with BCDC's "Financing the Future" recommendation.
- Private sector involvement is mostly business groups that represent private sector and large employers, industries, refineries.
- Implementation recommendation will go to Board on December 1 (tentative). Packet will be available November 21st or so. Lindy Lowe will share with at least some steering committee members prior to publishing.
- One result of BCDC workshops is that state agencies have started contacting BCDC, recognizing that they're ahead of the state in dealing with sea level rise.
- Funding working group status of activities
 - Considered applying for an IRWMP grant but found that the application didn't fit what CHARG is trying to do.
 - Working group is developing ideas to increase awareness of FEMA 404 and 406 mitigation opportunities
 - Working group is exploring a legislative outreach program, similar to Sacramento's "Cap-to-Cap" program, possibly in collaborate with the Funding for the Future effort. CHARG can help raise awareness of other entities' legislative activities and can provide members background sheets so that the messaging is consistent.
 - Senator Diane Feinstein has asked the EPA to put funding into their budget for the Bay Area similar to what is done for other large estuaries in the US.
- Technical working group status of activities
 - Sea level rise science subgroup
 - David Behar has stepped down from his role as chair of the sea level rise science working group.
 - The final report of the sea level rise regional survey highlights the percentage of agencies thinking about sea level rise issues. It's a good start but CHARG should do something more with it; Kathy Schaefer will coordinate with Behar. It may have benefit to BCDC to indicate interest in sea level rise.
 - USACE is working on inland hydrology and other projects; Patrick O'Brien works with Kate White in Washington, D. C. on some of the relevant issues; Craig will try to keep us informed. Funding is an impediment to his participation in the working group.
 - Adaptation strategies subgroup
 - CHARG representatives met with State Department of Water Resources (DWR) on August 24.
 - State's focus is statewide and includes coastal issues, not just the Delta.
 - CHARG will align with climate group and invite folks involved in Delta model to adaptation strategies group to see how we can work together.
 - Adaptation strategies will seek to incorporate DWR input.

- The group developed a list and prioritized twenty-one research studies that need to be performed to support adaptation strategies development.
 - At the October 24 meeting, the group plans to identify who might take on gap analyses, and brainstorm dissemination of data once studies have been completed.
 - The group will develop a scope of work for each focus area, then find funding for the research that needs to be performed. ACFCD will reach out to GSA and other agencies. Suggested to reach out to academic institutions and/or other organizations that are doing similar work and have funding, and align CHARG projects with those; however, grants have their own agendas with specific requirements that are important to the NSF, and have limits. Kathy Schaefer will talk to Matt Gerhart about reaching out to academic institutions.
- Marin County Public Works permitted to take sediment dredged from a creek and place it in dikes near locations where levees will be needed. An effort was made to mimic natural flow of sediment despite being delivered by truck. Roger will write and distribute a summary of the project.
 - A key question is whether there will be enough sediment in the Bay for adaptation projects. USACE is very interested in that; Craig Conner will talk with Rohin Saleh.
 - Caltrans grant specified that a certain amount will go to studying some of the issues on the list, that's one source of funding.
 - Bay Area legislators will need to be educated on the issues and point out that there is a good collective in CHARG.
- Groundwater
 - Suggested a new chair be assigned. Craig Conner will be an *ex officio* committee member.
- Policy
 - Len Materman is still interested in chairing the group; he thinks the work is relevant and that CHARG is a good place to house it.
 - Suggested that CHARG host another policy working group, regarding potential legislation work or implementation strategy working group ideas, with a focused agenda and an identifiable result.
 - Roger Leventhal is open to being a co-chair and will talk to Len Materman offline.
 - Last meeting (July 2016) group discussed getting regulators together to give feedback on projects that have broader scope, and brainstorm how we can enable projects given the constraint of the permitting process. It is generally agreed that the process is problematic but the problem appears too big to open up.
 - BAFPAA has a number of initiatives to enhance USACE permitting promised. CHARG is encouraged to coordinate efforts with BAFPAA in order not to hit USACE from multiple sides on the same issues. Carl Morrison and Rick Thomasser are affiliated with both CHARG and BAFPAA.
 - Kathy Schaefer will send reference of Emery Rowe book dealing with this issue.
- Steering committee membership
 - Possible new steering committee members:
 - Rick Thomasser of Napa County and BAFPAA chair

- Representatives from State Coastal Conservancy and BAECCC
 - NGO SF Bay Joint Venture – Ann Morkill from San Francisco Bay National Wildlife Refuge (USFWS) and US Fish & Wildlife Service chair
 - Luisa Valiela from EPA
 - Diana Sokolove from San Francisco City & County and lead on Resilient by Design competition
 - Sustainability managers from large shoreline-based properties, e.g. Google and Facebook. Erika Powell has contact Audrey Davenport in Google’s real estate department. Agreed this more appropriate for stakeholder group than for steering committee.
- San Francisquito Creek Joint Powers Authority (SFCJPA), with involvement and funding from Facebook, has completed a new SAFER Bay Public Draft Feasibility Report, posted on their [homepage](#). The 200 pages of appendices are not at this link but Len Materman will send on request.
SFCJPA meet with Facebook representatives bi-weekly; they exhibit keen interest.
 - Mike Milke of the Santa Clara Valley Leadership Group (SCVLG), is interested on a company level but SCVLG hasn’t come to regional meetings that discuss general shoreline issues.
 - Suggested that a current steering committee member be assigned as an unofficial mentor, to act as main point of contact for orientation and/or questions.
 - Paul Detjens volunteered to act in this role for Rick Thomasser.
 - Matt Gerhart was nominated to act in this role for Luisa Valiela
 - It was agreed that decisions about new membership agencies be delayed until after the new year.
- 2017 CHARG stakeholder meeting planning
 - Last stakeholder meeting was November 2015. Discussion about how to address and interact with the stakeholder group, what CHARG has to offer them, and whether planning a stakeholder meeting is the best route to take, as these meetings require a lot of time and expense.
 - Quarterly newsletter was proposed but voted down due to cost and time needed for development as well as expected low readership.
 - Warner Chabot will work with Kathy Schaefer, Rohin Saleh, and Sybil Hatch and on a draft email communication to the stakeholder group outlining what CHARG has worked on and accomplished in 2016, and opportunities for involvement. They will send this to the Steering Committee for review and feedback before sending to the stakeholders.